

**Lemma.** For any  $A \subseteq \mathbf{R}$  and any bounded open interval  $I$ ,

$$|A| = |A \cap I| + |A \cap I^c|.$$

*Proof.*  $A = (A \cap I) \cup (A \cap I^c) \implies \text{LHS} \leq \text{RHS}$ . Assume that  $\text{LHS} < \text{RHS}$ , i.e.,  $\exists \{I_k\}$  s.t.

$$A \subseteq \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} I_k, \quad \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \ell(I_k) < |A \cap I| + |A \cap I^c|.$$

Split each  $I_k$  into one open interval inside  $I$ , collected in a new  $\{I_k\}$ , and two open intervals outside  $I$ , collected in  $\{J_k\}$ . Then

$$A \setminus \{a, b\} \subseteq \left( \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} I_k \right) \cup \left( \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} J_k \right), \quad I_k \subseteq I, J_k \subseteq I^c. \quad (1)$$

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \ell(I_k) + \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \ell(J_k) < |A \cap I| + |A \cap I^c|. \quad (2)$$

Add  $(a - \varepsilon, a + \varepsilon)$  and  $(b - \varepsilon, b + \varepsilon)$  to  $\{J_k\}$ . (1) becomes

$$A \subseteq \left( \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} I_k \right) \cup \left( \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} J_k \right), \quad (3)$$

and  $\varepsilon$  is small enough s.t. (2) still holds.

Analyze (1) and (3). We have

$$A \cap I \subseteq \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} I_k, \quad A \cap I^c \subseteq \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} J_k,$$

contradicting (2).  $\square$

**Problem.** Prove that for all  $A \subseteq \mathbf{R}$ ,

$$|A| = \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} |A \cap (-t, t)|.$$

*Proof.* The case where  $|A| = 0$  is trivial.

Now suppose  $|A| \in \mathbf{R}^+$ . Let  $\{I_k\}$  be s.t.

$$A \subseteq \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} I_k, \quad (4)$$

where each  $I_k$  is bounded and

$$|A| \leq \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \ell(I_k) < |A| + \varepsilon.$$

Then  $\exists n$  s.t.

$$\sum_{k=1}^n \ell(I_k) > |A| - \varepsilon.$$

$\exists t$  s.t.  $\bigcup_{k=1}^n I_k \subseteq (-t, t)$ . Now by (4), we have

$$A \cap (-t, t)^c \subseteq \bigcup_{k=n+1}^{\infty} I_k.$$

$$|A \cap (-t, t)^c| \leq \sum_{k=n+1}^{\infty} \ell(I_k) < (|A| + \varepsilon) - (|A| - \varepsilon) = 2\varepsilon.$$

Now suppose  $|A| = \infty$ . WLOG, suppose  $A \cap \mathbf{Z} = \emptyset$ ; otherwise consider  $A \setminus \mathbf{Z}$  instead of  $A$ . By repeatedly using the lemma, we can prove that

$$|A| = \sum_{n \in \mathbf{Z}} |A \cap (n, n+1)|.$$

Because  $|A| = \infty$ ,  $\exists m$  s.t.

$$\sum_{n=-m}^m |A \cap (n, n+1)| > C.$$

Hence

$$|A \cap (-m, m)| = \sum_{n=-m}^{m-1} |A \cap (n, n+1)| > C.$$

Here the first equality follows from repeatedly using the lemma.  $\square$